Open Data Open Possibilities

Disaggregated Data and its Potential for Corrective Justice in an Age of Inequality

Puja Kapai
Associate Professor, Faculty of Law
Convenor, Women’s Studies Research Centre, HKU
Identifying & Plugging the Justice Gap

- Visualising & Recognising the Impact of Law, Policies and Systems on Lived Realities of different groups within the community
- Identifying Sites of Disadvantage and Marginality
- Recognising the Justice Gap – the Visible and Invisible

- Developing Targeted Legal, Policy, Social Justice Responses
  - Closing the Justice Gap

- Measuring Progress, Evaluating Impact of Policies & Measures
  - Refining Response Mechanisms to Narrow the Gap Further
The Significance of Open Data

• What is the Data Telling Us?

• What does the Data NOT Tell us?

• What Does Absence of Data Tell us?

• The Importance of Disaggregated Data

• Intersectional Analysis; Targeted Recommendations & Interventions

• Ethical Concerns Underlying the Use of Data
My Research Focus: The Rights of Minorities

- Victims of Human Trafficking
- Ethnic Minorities
- Gender Based Violence
- Sexual Minorities
- Migrant Workers
- Children

Examine how legislation and policy frameworks ignore, discriminate against or exclude them from equal protection.
Addressing Hong Kong’s Justice Gap: EMs

• Hong Kong’s ethnic minorities comprise 8% of the population; ~4%, excluding Foreign Domestic Workers).

• Open Data sources
  • Quarterly general household survey size is not representative enough to convey reliable trends pertaining to such a small section of the population group
  • Population Census and By-Census Reports
  • Households with School Children of South Asian Ethnicities (2014)
  • Hong Kong Poverty Situation Report (2012 ff annual)
  • Poverty Situation Report on South Asians in Hong Kong (2014, 2016)

• Data Gaps Remain
Mapping Data & Reframing How We Problematisate
What are our knowledge GAPS?

Puja Kapai
September 2015

http://www.law.hku.hk/ccpl/pub/EMreport.html
Population by Age and Ethnicity

Ethnic Minorities are a source of talent now and for the future

Source: Key Demographic Data
Distribution by Gender, Age & Ethnicity
Hong Kong’s education system is failing ethnic minority children

**Age 3-5 Not in Kindergarten**
- China: 8.5%
- Nepal: 14.6%
- Pakistan: 16.1%
- Philippines: 19.4%

**Form 5 School Drop out**
- China: 6.4%
- Nepal: 6.4%
- Pakistan: 15.6%

**Post Secondary Education**
- China: 27.7%
- Nepal: 57.3%
- Pakistan: 54.2%
- Philippines: 26.1%
- Indonesia: 17%
- Malaysia: 16.4%
- Thailand: 13.1%

Special Education Needs (SEN) drop out from Primary to Secondary
- 57% vs. 5%
  - (Ethnic minorities vs. Whole population)

Source: Education Chapter
% who received at least Post-Secondary Education by Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Percentage of people from within specific ethnic groups who received at least post-secondary level education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Japanese</td>
<td>79.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korean</td>
<td>75.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>73.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>57.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Asian</td>
<td>51.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filipino</td>
<td>54.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistani</td>
<td>17.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepalese</td>
<td>16.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thai</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesian</td>
<td>26.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whole Population of Hong Kong</td>
<td>27.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Work Force Participation Rate among Female Ethnic Minorities by Ethnicity and Age (excluding foreign domestic helpers)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>Work Force Participation Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15-24</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65 or above</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Reproduced from Hong Kong Council of Social Service, ‘Ethnic Minorities in Hong Kong’ (n 13).
Poverty is a serious problem facing ethnic minorities—and so is child poverty.

Percentage of Population in Low-Income Households (Poverty Rate)

Percentage of Child under 0-14 Under Poverty 2011

Poverty Among Under 25yrs = 55.6% (cf. 45.2%)

Source: Poverty Chapter
Household size is important

Bigger households have disproportionately low income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Size</th>
<th>Pakistani</th>
<th>Nepalese</th>
<th>Indian</th>
<th>Indonesian</th>
<th>Filipino</th>
<th>Thai</th>
<th>Whole population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 person</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td>11,500</td>
<td>38,750</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td>8,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% change</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>65.2%</td>
<td>-1.9%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 persons</td>
<td>11,000</td>
<td>19,000</td>
<td>38,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>19,500</td>
<td>13,000</td>
<td>16,040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% change</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
<td>36.8%</td>
<td>86.0%</td>
<td>67.9%</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
<td>43.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 persons</td>
<td>12,000</td>
<td>21,000</td>
<td>52,000</td>
<td>18,600</td>
<td>32,750</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td>23,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% change</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
<td>22.4%</td>
<td>-23.0%</td>
<td>61.3%</td>
<td>-8.4%</td>
<td>14.4%</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 persons or above</td>
<td>13,000</td>
<td>25,700</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>20,600</td>
<td>28,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disaggregated Data & Applied Intersectional Analytical Framework

- Highlighted the disparate impact of law and policy on minorities and a critical lack of equality
- Challenged traditional frames of assessment and underlying assumptions informing various measures & services to ethnic minorities as effective
- Challenged the status quo / belief that law and policy in Hong Kong guaranteed equality before the law regardless of race, ethnicity, or other status by providing evidence of weak nexus between those commitments and outcomes in practice
Summary of the Impact

Steering Committee on EM Issues

Policy Commitments, Budgeting and Resource Allocation by Relevant Bureaus and Departments Responding to Recommendations

Legislative Council (LegCo) Subcommittee on EM Issues set up to examine several themes in greater depth. Referenced research findings and called on HKSAR Government to follow up on recommendations in the report

Applied intersectionality framework is being increasingly recognised as an important benchmark for effective policy-making and handling ethnic minority issues

Raising community/public understanding about ethnic minorities (EMs) and issues impacting them & enhancing understanding

Prompted review and reassessment of existing laws, policies, capacity building and service delivery towards EMs across many areas, including violence against women, poverty, education, employment and healthcare – from intersectional perspective

Propelled NGOs to conduct research to collect data to work towards evidence-based resource allocation & solutions.
THANK YOU